

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA**

CAMPAIGN FOR ACCOUNTABILITY,
611 Pennsylvania Avenue SE, #337
Washington, DC 20003

Plaintiff,

v.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF
HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES,
200 Independence Avenue SW
Washington, DC 20201

Defendant.

Case No. 19-cv-0625

COMPLAINT

1. Plaintiff Campaign for Accountability brings this action against the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C. § 552 (FOIA), and the Declaratory Judgment Act, 28 U.S.C. §§ 2201 and 2202, seeking declaratory and injunctive relief to compel compliance with the requirements of FOIA.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

2. This Court has jurisdiction over this action pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(B) and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 2201, and 2202.

3. Venue is proper in this district pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(B) and 28 U.S.C. § 1391(e).

4. Because Defendant U.S. Department of Health and Human Services has failed to comply with the applicable time-limit provisions of the FOIA, Campaign for Accountability is deemed to have constructively exhausted its administrative remedies pursuant to 5 U.S.C.

§ 552(a)(6)(C)(i) and is now entitled to judicial action enjoining the agency from continuing to withhold agency records and ordering the production of agency records improperly withheld.

PARTIES

5. Plaintiff Campaign for Accountability (“CfA”) is a nonpartisan, non-profit section 501(c)(3) organization primarily engaged in disseminating information to the public. CfA uses research, litigation, and communications to expose misconduct and malfeasance in public life. Through research and FOIA requests, CfA uses the information it gathers, and its analysis of it, to educate the public about the activities and operations of the federal government, local and state governments and other public actors through reports, published analyses, press releases, and other media. The organization is incorporated under the laws of the District of Columbia.

6. Defendant the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (“HHS”) is a department of the executive branch of the U.S. government headquartered in Washington, DC, and an agency of the federal government within the meaning of 5 U.S.C. § 552(f)(1). HHS has possession, custody, and control of the records that CfA seeks.

STATEMENT OF FACTS

7. Title X is a federal grant program dedicated to providing comprehensive family planning and related preventative healthcare services and is designed to prioritize low-income individuals.

8. In May 2018, Diane Foley was appointed Deputy Assistant Secretary for Population Affairs. In this role Ms. Foley leads the office responsible for administering the Title X Federal Family Planning Program.

9. Obria Medical Clinics, together with its affiliate Obria Group (collectively “Obria”), is a collection of nonprofit pregnancy clinics. Obria clinics oppose abortion without

exception and do not offer contraceptive choices, including condoms, beyond fertility awareness. Obria applied for Title X grant funding in 2018 and 2019.

10. On December 20, 2018, CfA submitted FOIA requests to HHS seeking calendars and communications of certain HHS officials and with certain organizations. The specifics of each request are set out in detail below.

FOIA Request #1 —Diane Foley's Calendars

11. On December 20, 2018, CfA submitted a FOIA request to HHS seeking:

All calendars or calendar entries for Diane Foley, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Population Affairs, from the date that Ms. Foley joined HHS to the date the search is conducted, including any calendars maintained on her behalf (e.g., by an administrative assistant or a scheduler).

12. A copy of CfA's December 20, 2018 FOIA request regarding Ms. Foley's calendars is attached hereto as Exhibit A and is incorporated herein.

13. HHS has not sent CfA any acknowledgment of, tracking number for, or communication concerning this request.

FOIA Request #2 —Diane Foley's Communications

14. On December 20, 2018, CfA submitted a FOIA request to HHS seeking:

All communications, meeting notices, meeting agendas, informational materials, draft legislation, talking points, reports, disclosures, or other documents sent or received by Diane Foley, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Population Affairs.

15. This request sought all responsive records from the date Ms. Foley joined the agency to the date of the search. A copy of CfA's December 20, 2018 FOIA request regarding Ms. Foley's communications is attached hereto as Exhibit B and is incorporated herein.

16. HHS has not sent CfA any acknowledgment of, tracking number for, or communication concerning this request.

FOIA Request #3 — Obria Communications

17. On December 20, 2018, CfA submitted a FOIA request to HHS seeking:

All communications, meeting notices, meeting agendas, informational materials, draft legislation, talking points, reports, disclosures, or other documents received by any HHS employee or representative from, sent by any HHS employee or representative to, or exchanged between any HHS employee or representative and any employee or representative of Obria Medical Clinics or Obria Group.

18. This request sought all responsive records from January 20, 2017, to the date of the search. A copy of CfA's December 20, 2018 FOIA request regarding Obria communications is attached hereto as Exhibit C and is incorporated herein.

19. HHS has not sent CfA any acknowledgment of, tracking number for, or communication concerning this request.

Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies

20. As of the date of this Complaint, HHS has failed to (a) notify CfA of a final determination regarding any of the FOIA requests, including the scope of any responsive records HHS intends to produce or withhold and the reasons for any withholdings; or (b) produce the requested records or demonstrate that the requested records are lawfully exempt from production.

21. Through Defendant's failure to respond to CfA's FOIA requests within the time period required by law, CfA has constructively exhausted its administrative remedies and seeks immediate judicial review.

COUNT I

Violation of FOIA, 5 U.S.C. § 552

Failure to Conduct Adequate Searches for Responsive Records

22. CfA repeats the allegations in the foregoing paragraphs and incorporates them as though fully set forth herein.

23. CfA properly requested records within the possession, custody, and control of HHS.

24. HHS is an agency subject to FOIA and must therefore make reasonable efforts to search for requested records.

25. HHS has failed to promptly review agency records for the purpose of locating those records that are responsive to CfA's FOIA requests.

26. HHS's failure to conduct adequate searches for responsive records violates FOIA.

27. Plaintiff CfA is therefore entitled to declaratory and injunctive relief requiring Defendant to promptly make reasonable efforts to search for records responsive to CfA's FOIA requests.

COUNT II
Violation of FOIA, 5 U.S.C. § 552
Wrongful Withholding of Non-Exempt Records

28. CfA repeats the allegations in the foregoing paragraphs and incorporates them as though fully set forth herein.

29. CfA properly requested records within the possession, custody, and control of HHS.

30. HHS is an agency subject to FOIA and must therefore release in response to a FOIA request any non-exempt records and provide a lawful reason for withholding any materials.

31. HHS is wrongfully withholding non-exempt agency records requested by CfA by failing to produce records responsive to its FOIA requests.

32. HHS is wrongfully withholding non-exempt agency records requested by CfA by failing to segregate exempt information in otherwise non-exempt records responsive to CfA's FOIA requests.

33. HHS's failure to provide all non-exempt responsive records violates FOIA.

34. Plaintiff CfA is therefore entitled to declaratory and injunctive relief requiring Defendant to promptly produce all non-exempt records responsive to its FOIA requests and

provide an index justifying the withholding of any responsive records withheld under claim of exemption.

REQUESTED RELIEF

WHEREFORE, CfA respectfully requests the Court to:

- (1) Order Defendant to conduct a search or searches reasonably calculated to uncover all records responsive to CfA's FOIA requests;
- (2) Order Defendant to produce, by such date as the Court deems appropriate, any and all non-exempt records responsive to CfA's FOIA requests and an index justifying the withholding of any responsive records withheld under claim of exemption;
- (3) Enjoin Defendant from continuing to withhold any and all non-exempt records responsive to CfA's FOIA requests;
- (4) Award CfA the costs of this proceeding, including reasonable attorneys' fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred in this action, pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(E);
and
- (5) Grant CfA such other relief as the Court deems just and proper.

Dated: March 6, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Sara Kaiser Creighton

Sara Kaiser Creighton
D.C. Bar No. 1002367

AMERICAN OVERSIGHT
1030 15th Street NW, B255
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 869-5245
sara.creighton@americanoversight.org

Alice Clare Campbell Huling*
CAMPAIGN FOR ACCOUNTABILITY
611 Pennsylvania Ave. SE, #337
Washington, DC 20003
(202) 780-5750

ahuling@campaignforaccountability.org

*Counsel for Plaintiff
Campaign for Accountability*

**Pro hac vice application forthcoming*

EXHIBIT A

C A M P A I G N F O R

ACCOUNTABILITY

December 20, 2018

By Fax: FOIARequest@hhs.gov

Michael Marquis
Freedom of Information Officer
Department of Health and Human Services
Hubert H. Humphrey Building, Room 729H
200 Independence Avenue SW
Washington, D.C. 20201

Re: Freedom of Information Request

Dear Mr. Marquis:

Campaign for Accountability (“CfA”) makes this request for records pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (“FOIA”), 5 U.S.C. §§552, et seq., and the Department of Health and Human Services (“HHS”) implementing regulations, 45 C.F.R. Part 5.

Specifically, CfA requests that HHS produce the following within 20 business days:

All calendars or calendar entries for Diane Foley, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Population Affairs, from the date that Ms. Foley joined HHS to the date the search is conducted, including any calendars maintained on her behalf (e.g., by an administrative assistant or a scheduler).

For calendar entries created in Outlook or similar programs, the documents should be produced in “memo” form to include all invitees, any notes, and all attachments. Please do not limit your search to Outlook calendars. CfA requests that the production of any calendar—paper or electronic, whether on government-issued or personal devices—used to track or coordinate how Ms. Foley allocates her time on agency business.

By way of background, as Deputy Assistant Secretary for Population Affairs Ms. Foley leads the office responsible for administering the Title X Federal Family Planning Program.¹ Prior to her appointment Ms. Foley served as president and CEO of Life Network, which operated two crisis pregnancy centers that oppose abortion and certain types of contraception.²

In addition to the records requested above, please provide records reflecting the processing of this request, including any tracking sheets; records sufficient to identify search terms used, and

¹ Ally Boguhn, *Trump’s HHS Installs Fake Clinic Leader to Oversee Family Planning Funds*, REWIRE.NEWS (May 30, 2018), available at <https://rewire.news/article/2018/05/30/trumps-hhs-installs-fake-clinic-leader-oversee-family-planning-funds/>.

² *Id.*

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 2

locations and custodians searched. If your agency uses FOIA questionnaires or certifications completed by individual custodians or components to determine whether they possess responsive materials or to describe how they conducted searches, we also request any such records prepared in connection with the processing of this request.

CfA seeks all responsive records regardless of format, medium, or physical characteristics. In conducting your search, please understand the terms “record,” “document,” and “information” in their broadest sense, to include any written, typed, recorded, graphic, printed, or audio material of any kind. We seek records of any kind, including electronic records, audiotapes, videotapes, and photographs, as well as letters, emails, facsimiles, telephone messages, voice mail messages and transcripts, notes, or minutes of any meetings, telephone conversations, or discussions. Our request includes any attachments to these records. No category of material should be omitted from search, collection, and production.

Please search all records regarding agency business. Please do not exclude searches of files or emails in the personal custody of agency officials, such as personal email accounts. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files is subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.³ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; CfA has a right to access those files even if they have not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, through negligence or willfulness, failed to meet their obligations.⁴

In addition, please note that in conducting a “reasonable search” as required by law, HHS must employ the most up-to-date technologies and tools available, in addition to searches by individual custodians likely to have responsive information. Recent technology may have rendered HHS’s prior FOIA practices unreasonable. In light of the government-wide requirements to manage information electronically by the end of 2016, it is no longer reasonable to rely exclusively on custodian-driven searches.⁵ Furthermore, agencies that have adopted the National Archives and Records Agency (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies, now maintain emails in a form that is reasonably likely to be more complete than individual custodians’ files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but HHS’s archiving tools would capture that email under Capstone. Accordingly, CfA insists that HHS use the most up-to-date technologies to search for responsive information and take steps to ensure that the most

³ See *Competitive Enterprise Institute v. Office of Science & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149—150 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955—956 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

⁴ See *Competitive Enterprise Institute v. Office of Science & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149—150 (D.C. Cir. 2016) (“The Government argues that because the agency had a policy requiring [the official] to forward all of his emails from his [personal] account to his business email, the [personal] account only contains duplicate agency records at best. Therefore, the Government claims that any hypothetical deletion of the [personal account] emails would still leave a copy of those records intact in [the official’s] work email. However, policies are rarely followed to perfection by anyone. At this stage of the case, the Court cannot assume that each and every work-related email in the [personal] account was duplicated in [the official’s] work email account.” (citations omitted)).

⁵ Presidential Memorandum – Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), available at <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records Directive,” M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), available at <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 3

complete repositories of information are searched. CfA is available to work with HHS to craft appropriate search terms. However, custodian searches are still required; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.

Under the FOIA Improvement Act of 2016, agencies must adopt a presumption of disclosure, withholding information “only if . . . disclosure would harm an interest protected by an exemption” or “disclosure is prohibited by law.”⁶ If it is your position that any portion of the requested records is exempt from disclosure, CfA requests that you provide an index of those documents as required under *Vaughn v. Rosen*, 484 F.2d 820 (D.C. Cir. 1973), *cert. denied*, 415 U.S. 977 (1974). As you are aware, a *Vaughn* index must describe each document claimed as exempt with sufficient specificity “to permit a reasoned judgment as to whether the material is actually exempt under FOIA.”⁷ Moreover, the *Vaughn* index “must describe *each* document or portion thereof withheld, and for *each* withholding it must discuss the consequences of disclosing the sought-after information.”⁸ Further, “the withholding agency must supply ‘a relatively detailed justification, specifically identifying the reasons why a particular exemption is relevant and correlating those claims with the particular part of a withheld document to which they apply.’”⁹

In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If it is your position that a document contains non-exempt segments, but that those non-exempt segments are so dispersed throughout the document as to make segregation impossible, please state what portion of the document is non-exempt, and how the material is dispersed throughout the document.¹⁰ Claims of nonsegregability must be made with the same degree of detail as required for claims of exemptions in a *Vaughn* index. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically that it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.

To ensure that this request is properly construed, that searches are conducted in an adequate but efficient manner, and that extraneous costs are not incurred, CfA welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with HHS before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs. By working together at the outset, CfA and HHS can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in electronic format via email at ahuling@campaignforaccountability.org. Alternatively, our mailing address is Campaign for Accountability, 611 Pennsylvania Avenue SE, #337, Washington DC 20003. If it will accelerate the release, please also provide responsive material on rolling basis.

⁶ FOIA Improvement Act of 2016 § 2 (Pub. L. No. 114–185).

⁷ *Founding Church of Scientology v. Bell*, 603 F.2d 945, 949 (D.C. Cir. 1979).

⁸ *King v. U.S. Dep’t of Justice*, 830 F.2d 210, 223–24 (D.C. Cir. 1987) (emphasis in original).

⁹ *Id.* at 224 (citing *Mead Data Central, Inc. v. U.S. Dep’t of the Air Force*, 566 F.2d 242, 251 (D.C. Cir. 1977)).

¹⁰ *Mead Data Central*, 566 F.2d at 261.

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 4

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and 45 C.F.R. § 5.54, CfA requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute significantly to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public. Moreover, the request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).¹¹

CfA requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is in the public interest because it is “likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of the operations or activities of the government.”¹² The disclosure of the information sought under this request will document and reveal the operations of the federal government, including how officials conduct the public’s business.

The records CfA seeks will help the public understand whose interests HHS is considering as it makes decisions that have a profound effect on the ability of individuals, and especially women, to make their own family planning choices.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes. As a 501(c)(3) organization, CfA does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in CfA’s financial interest. CfA is committed to protecting the public’s right to be aware of the activities of government officials and to ensuring the integrity of those officials. CfA uses a combination of research, litigation, and advocacy to advance its mission. CfA will analyze the information responsive to this request, and will share its analysis with the public, either through memoranda, reports, or press releases. In addition, CfA will disseminate any documents it acquires from this request to the public through its website, www.campaignforaccountability.org.

Accordingly, CfA qualifies for a fee waiver.

News Media Fee Waiver Request

CfA also asks that it not be charged search or review fees for this request because CfA qualifies as a “representative of the news media” pursuant to the FOIA and HHS regulation 45 C.F.R. §5.53. In *Nat’l Sec. Archive v. U.S. Dep’t of Defense*, 880 F.2d 1381, 1386 (D.C. Cir. 1989), the Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit found the National Security Archive was a representative of the news media under the FOIA, relying on the FOIA’s legislative history, which indicates the phrase “representative of the news media” is to be interpreted broadly; “[i]t is critical that the phrase ‘representative of the news media’ be broadly interpreted if the act is to work as expected . . . In fact, *any person or organization which regularly publishes or disseminates information to the public . . . should qualify for waivers as a ‘representative of the news media.’*” 132 Cong. Rec. S14298 (daily ed. Sept. 30, 1986) (emphasis added), cited in *id.* CfA meets this test.

¹¹ See, e.g., *McClellan Ecological Seepage Situation v. Carlucci*, 835 F.2d 1282, 1285 (9th Cir. 1987).

¹² 45 C.F.R. § 5.54(a).

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 5

CfA routinely and systematically “gathers information of potential interest to a segment of the public, uses its editorial skills to turn raw materials into a distinct work, and distributes that work to an audience.”¹³ It does so by regularly posting documents it receives through open records laws, including the FOIA, to its website,¹⁴ analyzing those documents, and publishing reports, letters, and further requests based those documents.¹⁵ Based on its publication activities, CfA qualifies as a “representative of the news media” under the FOIA and agency regulations.

Conclusion

CfA looks forward to working with HHS on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, have any questions, or foresee any problems in fully releasing the requested records, please contact me at 202-780-5750. Further, if CfA’s request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact me immediately upon making such a determination.

Thank you for your assistance.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Alice C.C. Huling'.

Alice C.C. Huling
Counsel

¹³ 45 C.F.R. § 5.3; 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(ii)(III).

¹⁴ Letter from Alice C.C. Huling, Counsel, Campaign for Accountability, to Daniel R. Levinson, Inspector General, U.S. Department of Health & Human Services (Dec. 17, 2018), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/complaint-against-office-of-refugee-resettlement-for-proselytizing-impeding-access-to-abortion/>; Letter from Daniel Stevens, Executive Director, Campaign for Accountability, to Thomas B. Pahl, Acting Director, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission (July 19, 2017), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/ftc-solar-complaint/>.

¹⁵ Alice C.C. Huling, *Pro-Choice or Anti-Abortion, We Should All Agree Women Need Real Healthcare*, MEDIUM, (Nov. 13, 2018), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/pro-choice-or-anti-abortion-we-should-all-agree-women-need-real-healthcare/>; Campaign for Accountability, Utah Commission for the Stewardship of Public Lands (Sept. 7, 2017), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/utah-commission-stewardship-public-lands/>; CfA Complaints Against the Heidi Group (Sept. 26, 2017), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/cfa-complaints-against-the-heidi-group/>.

EXHIBIT B

C A M P A I G N F O R

ACCOUNTABILITY

December 20, 2018

By Fax: FOIARequest@hhs.gov

Michael Marquis
Freedom of Information Officer
Department of Health and Human Services
Hubert H. Humphrey Building, Room 729H
200 Independence Avenue SW
Washington, D.C. 20201

Re: Freedom of Information Request

Dear Mr. Marquis:

Campaign for Accountability (“CfA”) makes this request for records pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (“FOIA”), 5 U.S.C. §§552, et seq., and the Department of Health and Human Services (“HHS”) implementing regulations, 45 C.F.R. Part 5.

Specifically, CfA requests that HHS produce the following within 20 business days:

All communications, meeting notices, meeting agendas, informational materials, draft legislation, talking points, reports, disclosures, or other documents sent or received by Diane Foley, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Population Affairs.

Please provide all responsive records from the date that Ms. Foley joined HHS to the date the search is conducted.

By way of background, in her position as Deputy Assistant Secretary for Population Affairs Ms. Foley leads the office responsible for administering the Title X Federal Family Planning Program.¹ Prior to her appointment Ms. Foley served as president and CEO of Life Network, which operated two crisis pregnancy centers that oppose abortion and certain types of contraception.²

In addition to the records requested above, please provide records reflecting the processing of this request, including any tracking sheets; records sufficient to identify search terms used, and locations and custodians searched. If your agency uses FOIA questionnaires or certifications completed by individual custodians or components to determine whether they possess responsive materials or to describe how they conducted searches, we also request any such records prepared in connection with the processing of this request.

¹ Ally Boguhn, *Trump’s HHS Installs Fake Clinic Leader to Oversee Family Planning Funds*, REWIRE.NEWS (May 30, 2018), available at <https://rewire.news/article/2018/05/30/trumps-hhs-installs-fake-clinic-leader-oversee-family-planning-funds/>.

² *Id.*

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 2

CfA seeks all responsive records regardless of format, medium, or physical characteristics. In conducting your search, please understand the terms “record,” “document,” and “information” in their broadest sense, to include any written, typed, recorded, graphic, printed, or audio material of any kind. We seek records of any kind, including electronic records, audiotapes, videotapes, and photographs, as well as letters, emails, facsimiles, telephone messages, voice mail messages and transcripts, notes, or minutes of any meetings, telephone conversations, or discussions. Our request includes any attachments to these records. No category of material should be omitted from search, collection, and production.

Please search all records regarding agency business. Please do not exclude searches of files or emails in the personal custody of agency officials, such as personal email accounts. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files is subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.³ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; CfA has a right to access those files even if they have not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, through negligence or willfulness, failed to meet their obligations.⁴

In addition, please note that in conducting a “reasonable search” as required by law, HHS must employ the most up-to-date technologies and tools available, in addition to searches by individual custodians likely to have responsive information. Recent technology may have rendered HHS’s prior FOIA practices unreasonable. In light of the government-wide requirements to manage information electronically by the end of 2016, it is no longer reasonable to rely exclusively on custodian-driven searches.⁵ Furthermore, agencies that have adopted the National Archives and Records Agency (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies, now maintain emails in a form that is reasonably likely to be more complete than individual custodians’ files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but HHS’s archiving tools would capture that email under Capstone. Accordingly, CfA insists that HHS use the most up-to-date technologies to search for responsive information and take steps to ensure that the most complete repositories of information are searched. CfA is available to work with HHS to craft appropriate search terms. However, custodian searches are still required; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.

³ See *Competitive Enterprise Institute v. Office of Science & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149—150 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955—956 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

⁴ See *Competitive Enterprise Institute v. Office of Science & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149—150 (D.C. Cir. 2016) (“The Government argues that because the agency had a policy requiring [the official] to forward all of his emails from his [personal] account to his business email, the [personal] account only contains duplicate agency records at best. Therefore, the Government claims that any hypothetical deletion of the [personal account] emails would still leave a copy of those records intact in [the official’s] work email. However, policies are rarely followed to perfection by anyone. At this stage of the case, the Court cannot assume that each and every work-related email in the [personal] account was duplicated in [the official’s] work email account.” (citations omitted)).

⁵ Presidential Memorandum – Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), available at <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records Directive,” M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), available at <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 3

Under the FOIA Improvement Act of 2016, agencies must adopt a presumption of disclosure, withholding information “only if . . . disclosure would harm an interest protected by an exemption” or “disclosure is prohibited by law.”⁶ If it is your position that any portion of the requested records is exempt from disclosure, CfA requests that you provide an index of those documents as required under *Vaughn v. Rosen*, 484 F.2d 820 (D.C. Cir. 1973), *cert. denied*, 415 U.S. 977 (1974). As you are aware, a *Vaughn* index must describe each document claimed as exempt with sufficient specificity “to permit a reasoned judgment as to whether the material is actually exempt under FOIA.”⁷ Moreover, the *Vaughn* index “must describe *each* document or portion thereof withheld, and for *each* withholding it must discuss the consequences of disclosing the sought-after information.”⁸ Further, “the withholding agency must supply ‘a relatively detailed justification, specifically identifying the reasons why a particular exemption is relevant and correlating those claims with the particular part of a withheld document to which they apply.’”⁹

In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If it is your position that a document contains non-exempt segments, but that those non-exempt segments are so dispersed throughout the document as to make segregation impossible, please state what portion of the document is non-exempt, and how the material is dispersed throughout the document.¹⁰ Claims of nonsegregability must be made with the same degree of detail as required for claims of exemptions in a *Vaughn* index. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically that it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.

To ensure that this request is properly construed, that searches are conducted in an adequate but efficient manner, and that extraneous costs are not incurred, CfA welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with HHS before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs. By working together at the outset, CfA and HHS can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in electronic format via email at ahuling@campaignforaccountability.org. Alternatively, our mailing address is Campaign for Accountability, 611 Pennsylvania Avenue SE, #337, Washington DC 20003. If it will accelerate the release, please also provide responsive material on rolling basis.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and 45 C.F.R. § 5.54, CfA requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute significantly to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public. Moreover, the

⁶ FOIA Improvement Act of 2016 § 2 (Pub. L. No. 114–185).

⁷ *Founding Church of Scientology v. Bell*, 603 F.2d 945, 949 (D.C. Cir. 1979).

⁸ *King v. U.S. Dep’t of Justice*, 830 F.2d 210, 223–24 (D.C. Cir. 1987) (emphasis in original).

⁹ *Id.* at 224 (citing *Mead Data Central, Inc. v. U.S. Dep’t of the Air Force*, 566 F.2d 242, 251 (D.C. Cir. 1977)).

¹⁰ *Mead Data Central*, 566 F.2d at 261.

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 4

request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).¹¹

CfA requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is in the public interest because it is “likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of the operations or activities of the government.”¹² The disclosure of the information sought under this request will document and reveal the operations of the federal government, including how officials conduct the public’s business.

The records CfA seeks will help the public understand whose interests HHS is considering as it makes decisions that have a profound effect on the ability of individuals, and especially women, to make their own family planning choices.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes. As a 501(c)(3) organization, CfA does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in CfA’s financial interest. CfA is committed to protecting the public’s right to be aware of the activities of government officials and to ensuring the integrity of those officials. CfA uses a combination of research, litigation, and advocacy to advance its mission. CfA will analyze the information responsive to this request, and will share its analysis with the public, either through memoranda, reports, or press releases. In addition, CfA will disseminate any documents it acquires from this request to the public through its website, www.campaignforaccountability.org.

Accordingly, CfA qualifies for a fee waiver.

News Media Fee Waiver Request

CfA also asks that it not be charged search or review fees for this request because CfA qualifies as a “representative of the news media” pursuant to the FOIA and HHS regulation 45 C.F.R. §5.53. In *Nat’l Sec. Archive v. U.S. Dep’t of Defense*, 880 F.2d 1381, 1386 (D.C. Cir. 1989), the Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit found the National Security Archive was a representative of the news media under the FOIA, relying on the FOIA’s legislative history, which indicates the phrase “representative of the news media” is to be interpreted broadly; “[i]t is critical that the phrase ‘representative of the news media’ be broadly interpreted if the act is to work as expected . . . In fact, *any person or organization which regularly publishes or disseminates information to the public . . . should qualify for waivers as a ‘representative of the news media.’*” 132 Cong. Rec. S14298 (daily ed. Sept. 30, 1986) (emphasis added), cited in *id.* CfA meets this test.

CfA routinely and systematically “gathers information of potential interest to a segment of the public, uses its editorial skills to turn raw materials into a distinct work, and distributes that work to an audience.”¹³ It does so by regularly posting documents it receives through open records laws,

¹¹ See, e.g., *McClellan Ecological Seepage Situation v. Carlucci*, 835 F.2d 1282, 1285 (9th Cir. 1987).

¹² 45 C.F.R. § 5.54(a).

¹³ 45 C.F.R. § 5.3; 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(ii)(III).

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 5

including the FOIA, to its website,¹⁴ analyzing those documents, and publishing reports, letters, and further requests based those documents.¹⁵ Based on its publication activities, CfA qualifies as a “representative of the news media” under the FOIA and agency regulations.

Conclusion

CfA looks forward to working with HHS on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, have any questions, or foresee any problems in fully releasing the requested records, please contact me at 202-780-5750. Further, if CfA’s request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact me immediately upon making such a determination.

Thank you for your assistance.

Sincerely,



Alice C.C. Huling
Counsel

¹⁴ Letter from Alice C.C. Huling, Counsel, Campaign for Accountability, to Daniel R. Levinson, Inspector General, U.S. Department of Health & Human Services (Dec. 17, 2018), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/complaint-against-office-of-refugee-resettlement-for-proselytizing-impeding-access-to-abortion/>; Letter from Daniel Stevens, Executive Director, Campaign for Accountability, to Thomas B. Pahl, Acting Director, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission (July 19, 2017), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/ftc-solar-complaint/>.

¹⁵ Alice C.C. Huling, *Pro-Choice or Anti-Abortion, We Should All Agree Women Need Real Healthcare*, MEDIUM, (Nov. 13, 2018), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/pro-choice-or-anti-abortion-we-should-all-agree-women-need-real-healthcare/>; Campaign for Accountability, Utah Commission for the Stewardship of Public Lands (Sept. 7, 2017), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/utah-commission-stewardship-public-lands/>; CfA Complaints Against the Heidi Group (Sept. 26, 2017), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/cfa-complaints-against-the-heidi-group/>.

EXHIBIT C

C A M P A I G N F O R

ACCOUNTABILITY

December 20, 2018

By Fax: FOIARequest@hhs.gov

Michael Marquis
Freedom of Information Officer
Department of Health and Human Services
Hubert H. Humphrey Building, Room 729H
200 Independence Avenue SW
Washington, D.C. 20201

Re: Freedom of Information Request

Dear Mr. Marquis:

Campaign for Accountability (“CfA”) makes this request for records pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (“FOIA”), 5 U.S.C. §§552, et seq., and the Department of Health and Human Services (“HHS”) implementing regulations, 45 C.F.R. Part 5.

Specifically, CfA requests that HHS produce the following within 20 business days:

1. All communications, meeting notices, meeting agendas, informational materials, draft legislation, talking points, reports, disclosures, or other documents received by any HHS employee or representative from, sent by any HHS employee or representative to, or exchanged between any HHS employee or representative and any employee or representative of:
 - a. Obria Medical Clinics; or
 - b. Obria Group

Please provide all responsive records from January 20, 2017, to the date the search is conducted.

By way of background, it has been reported that Obria Medical Clinics, together with its affiliate Obria Group (collectively “Obria”), is seeking federal funding under Title X and has already received federal funding under Title V.¹ Obria’s 2018 application for Title X family planning grant was rejected because Obria did not comply with Title X rules requiring grantees “to include a provider that offers hormonal birth control,” but Obria now plans to “partner[] with a health center that provides contraception, though not abortion,” and reapply.²

¹ See Victoria Colliver, *Anti-Abortion Clinics Tapping Into Federal Funds Under Trump*, POLITICO (Dec. 16, 2018), available at <https://www.politico.com/story/2018/12/16/abortion-pregnancy-centers-planned-parenthood-1007765>.

² *Id.*

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 2

Obria is a nonprofit chain of pregnancy clinics that do not offer contraceptive choices, including condoms, beyond fertility awareness and opposes abortion, without exception.³ Obria models itself as an alternative to Planned Parenthood, and currently has clinics in five states.⁴

In addition to the records requested above, please provide records reflecting the processing of this request, including any tracking sheets; records sufficient to identify search terms used, and locations and custodians searched. If your agency uses FOIA questionnaires or certifications completed by individual custodians or components to determine whether they possess responsive materials or to describe how they conducted searches, we also request any such records prepared in connection with the processing of this request.

CfA seeks all responsive records regardless of format, medium, or physical characteristics. In conducting your search, please understand the terms “record,” “document,” and “information” in their broadest sense, to include any written, typed, recorded, graphic, printed, or audio material of any kind. We seek records of any kind, including electronic records, audiotapes, videotapes, and photographs, as well as letters, emails, facsimiles, telephone messages, voice mail messages and transcripts, notes, or minutes of any meetings, telephone conversations, or discussions. Our request includes any attachments to these records. No category of material should be omitted from search, collection, and production.

Please search all records regarding agency business. Please do not exclude searches of files or emails in the personal custody of agency officials, such as personal email accounts. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files is subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.⁵ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; CfA has a right to access those files even if they have not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, through negligence or willfulness, failed to meet their obligations.⁶

In addition, please note that in conducting a “reasonable search” as required by law, HHS must employ the most up-to-date technologies and tools available, in addition to searches by individual custodians likely to have responsive information. Recent technology may have rendered HHS’s prior FOIA practices unreasonable. In light of the government-wide requirements to manage information electronically by the end of 2016, it is no longer reasonable to rely exclusively on

³ *Id.*; see also Sarah Varney, ‘Contraception Deserts’ Likely to Widen Under New Trump Administration Policy, KAISER HEALTH NEWS (Sept. 28, 2018), available at <https://khn.org/news/contraception-deserts-likely-to-widen-under-new-trump-administration-policy/>.

⁴ *Id.*

⁵ See *Competitive Enterprise Institute v. Office of Science & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149—150 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955—956 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

⁶ See *Competitive Enterprise Institute v. Office of Science & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149—150 (D.C. Cir. 2016) (“The Government argues that because the agency had a policy requiring [the official] to forward all of his emails from his [personal] account to his business email, the [personal] account only contains duplicate agency records at best. Therefore, the Government claims that any hypothetical deletion of the [personal account] emails would still leave a copy of those records intact in [the official’s] work email. However, policies are rarely followed to perfection by anyone. At this stage of the case, the Court cannot assume that each and every work-related email in the [personal] account was duplicated in [the official’s] work email account.” (citations omitted)).

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 3

custodian-driven searches.⁷ Furthermore, agencies that have adopted the National Archives and Records Agency (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies, now maintain emails in a form that is reasonably likely to be more complete than individual custodians' files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but HHS's archiving tools would capture that email under Capstone. Accordingly, CfA insists that HHS use the most up-to-date technologies to search for responsive information and take steps to ensure that the most complete repositories of information are searched. CfA is available to work with HHS to craft appropriate search terms. However, custodian searches are still required; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.

Under the FOIA Improvement Act of 2016, agencies must adopt a presumption of disclosure, withholding information "only if . . . disclosure would harm an interest protected by an exemption" or "disclosure is prohibited by law."⁸ If it is your position that any portion of the requested records is exempt from disclosure, CfA requests that you provide an index of those documents as required under *Vaughn v. Rosen*, 484 F.2d 820 (D.C. Cir. 1973), *cert. denied*, 415 U.S. 977 (1974). As you are aware, a *Vaughn* index must describe each document claimed as exempt with sufficient specificity "to permit a reasoned judgment as to whether the material is actually exempt under FOIA."⁹ Moreover, the *Vaughn* index "must describe *each* document or portion thereof withheld, and for *each* withholding it must discuss the consequences of disclosing the sought-after information."¹⁰ Further, "the withholding agency must supply 'a relatively detailed justification, specifically identifying the reasons why a particular exemption is relevant and correlating those claims with the particular part of a withheld document to which they apply.'"¹¹

In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If it is your position that a document contains non-exempt segments, but that those non-exempt segments are so dispersed throughout the document as to make segregation impossible, please state what portion of the document is non-exempt, and how the material is dispersed throughout the document.¹² Claims of nonsegregability must be made with the same degree of detail as required for claims of exemptions in a *Vaughn* index. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically that it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.

To ensure that this request is properly construed, that searches are conducted in an adequate but efficient manner, and that extraneous costs are not incurred, CfA welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with HHS before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs.

⁷ Presidential Memorandum – Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), *available at* <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, "Managing Government Records Directive," M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), *available at* <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

⁸ FOIA Improvement Act of 2016 § 2 (Pub. L. No. 114–185).

⁹ *Founding Church of Scientology v. Bell*, 603 F.2d 945, 949 (D.C. Cir. 1979).

¹⁰ *King v. U.S. Dep't of Justice*, 830 F.2d 210, 223–24 (D.C. Cir. 1987) (emphasis in original).

¹¹ *Id.* at 224 (citing *Mead Data Central, Inc. v. U.S. Dep't of the Air Force*, 566 F.2d 242, 251 (D.C. Cir. 1977)).

¹² *Mead Data Central*, 566 F.2d at 261.

Department of Health and Human Services
December 20, 2018
Page 4

By working together at the outset, CfA and HHS can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in electronic format via email at ahuling@campaignforaccountability.org. Alternatively, our mailing address is Campaign for Accountability, 611 Pennsylvania Avenue SE, #337, Washington DC 20003. If it will accelerate the release, please also provide responsive material on rolling basis.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and 45 C.F.R. § 5.54, CfA requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute significantly to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public. Moreover, the request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).¹³

CfA requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is in the public interest because it is “likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of the operations or activities of the government.”¹⁴ The disclosure of the information sought under this request will document and reveal the operations of the federal government, including how officials conduct the public’s business.

Obria seeks federal funding, despite its refusal to provide FDA-approved contraceptives like birth control pills or condoms.¹⁵ Funding Obria could interfere with women’s access to comprehensive reproductive healthcare.¹⁶ The records CfA seeks will help the public understand whose interests HHS is considering as it makes decisions that have a profound effect on the ability of individuals, and especially women, to make their own family planning choices.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes. As a 501(c)(3) organization, CfA does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in CfA’s financial interest. CfA is committed to protecting the public’s right to be aware of the activities of government officials and to ensuring the integrity of those officials. CfA uses a combination of research, litigation, and advocacy to advance its mission. CfA will analyze the information responsive to this request, and will share its analysis with the public, either through memoranda, reports, or press releases. In addition, CfA will disseminate any documents it acquires from this request to the public through its website, www.campaignforaccountability.org.

Accordingly, CfA qualifies for a fee waiver.

¹³ See, e.g., *McClellan Ecological Seepage Situation v. Carlucci*, 835 F.2d 1282, 1285 (9th Cir. 1987).

¹⁴ 45 C.F.R. § 5.54(a).

¹⁵ See Victoria Colliver, *Anti-Abortion Clinics Tapping into Federal Funds Under Trump*, POLITICO (Dec. 16, 2018), available at <https://www.politico.com/story/2018/12/16/abortion-pregnancy-centers-planned-parenthood-1007765>.

¹⁶ See Sarah Varney, *‘Contraception Deserts’ Likely to Widen Under New Trump Administration Policy*, KAISER HEALTH NEWS (Sept. 28, 2018), available at <https://khn.org/news/contraception-deserts-likely-to-widen-under-new-trump-administration-policy/>.

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 5

News Media Fee Waiver Request

CfA also asks that it not be charged search or review fees for this request because CfA qualifies as a “representative of the news media” pursuant to the FOIA and HHS regulation 45 C.F.R. §5.53. In *Nat’l Sec. Archive v. U.S. Dep’t of Defense*, 880 F.2d 1381, 1386 (D.C. Cir. 1989), the Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit found the National Security Archive was a representative of the news media under the FOIA, relying on the FOIA’s legislative history, which indicates the phrase “representative of the news media” is to be interpreted broadly; “[i]t is critical that the phrase ‘representative of the news media’ be broadly interpreted if the act is to work as expected In fact, *any person or organization which regularly publishes or disseminates information to the public . . . should qualify for waivers as a ‘representative of the news media.’*” 132 Cong. Rec. S14298 (daily ed. Sept. 30, 1986) (emphasis added), cited in *id.* CfA meets this test.

CfA routinely and systematically “gathers information of potential interest to a segment of the public, uses its editorial skills to turn raw materials into a distinct work, and distributes that work to an audience.”¹⁷ It does so by regularly posting documents it receives through open records laws, including the FOIA, to its website,¹⁸ analyzing those documents, and publishing reports, letters, and further requests based those documents.¹⁹ Based on its publication activities, CfA qualifies as a “representative of the news media” under the FOIA and agency regulations.

Conclusion

CfA looks forward to working with HHS on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, have any questions, or foresee any problems in fully releasing the requested records,

¹⁷ 45 C.F.R. § 5.3; 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(ii)(III).

¹⁸ Letter from Alice C.C. Huling, Counsel, Campaign for Accountability, to Daniel R. Levinson, Inspector General, U.S. Department of Health & Human Services (Dec. 17, 2018), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/complaint-against-office-of-refugee-resettlement-for-proselytizing-impeding-access-to-abortion/>; Letter from Daniel Stevens, Executive Director, Campaign for Accountability, to Thomas B. Pahl, Acting Director, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission (July 19, 2017), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/ftc-solar-complaint/>.

¹⁹ Alice C.C. Huling, *Pro-Choice or Anti-Abortion, We Should All Agree Women Need Real Healthcare*, MEDIUM, (Nov. 13, 2018), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/pro-choice-or-anti-abortion-we-should-all-agree-women-need-real-healthcare/>; Campaign for Accountability, Utah Commission for the Stewardship of Public Lands (Sept. 7, 2017), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/utah-commission-stewardship-public-lands/>; CfA Complaints Against the Heidi Group (Sept. 26, 2017), *available at* <https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/cfa-complaints-against-the-heidi-group/>.

Department of Health and Human Services

December 20, 2018

Page 6

please contact me at 202-780-5750. Further, if CfA's request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact me immediately upon making such a determination.

Thank you for your assistance.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Alice C.C. Huling". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Alice" being more prominent.

Alice C.C. Huling
Counsel

ATTACHMENT E**CIVIL COVER SHEET**

JS-44 (Rev. 3/16 DC)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS Campaign for Accountability (b) COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF <u>11001</u> (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)	DEFENDANTS U.S. Department of Health and Human Services COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED DEFENDANT _____ (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) <small>NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED</small>
(c) ATTORNEYS (FIRM NAME, ADDRESS, AND TELEPHONE NUMBER) Sara Kaiser Creighton American Oversight, 1030 15th Street NW, B255 Washington, DC 20005 202.869.5245	ATTORNEYS (IF KNOWN)

II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (PLACE AN X IN ONE BOX ONLY) <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div style="width: 48%;"> <input type="radio"/> 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff </div> <div style="width: 48%;"> <input type="radio"/> 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party) </div> </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <div style="width: 48%;"> <input checked="" type="radio"/> 2 U.S. Government Defendant </div> <div style="width: 48%;"> <input type="radio"/> 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in item III) </div> </div>	III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES (PLACE AN X IN ONE BOX FOR PLAINTIFF AND ONE BOX FOR DEFENDANT) FOR DIVERSITY CASES ONLY! <table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th style="text-align: center;">PTF</th> <th style="text-align: center;">DFT</th> <th></th> <th style="text-align: center;">PTF</th> <th style="text-align: center;">DFT</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Citizen of this State</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 1</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 1</td> <td>Incorporated or Principal Place of Business in This State</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 4</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Citizen of Another State</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 2</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 2</td> <td>Incorporated and Principal Place of Business in Another State</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 5</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 3</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 3</td> <td>Foreign Nation</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 6</td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="radio"/> 6</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		PTF	DFT		PTF	DFT	Citizen of this State	<input type="radio"/> 1	<input type="radio"/> 1	Incorporated or Principal Place of Business in This State	<input type="radio"/> 4	<input type="radio"/> 4	Citizen of Another State	<input type="radio"/> 2	<input type="radio"/> 2	Incorporated and Principal Place of Business in Another State	<input type="radio"/> 5	<input type="radio"/> 5	Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country	<input type="radio"/> 3	<input type="radio"/> 3	Foreign Nation	<input type="radio"/> 6	<input type="radio"/> 6
	PTF	DFT		PTF	DFT																				
Citizen of this State	<input type="radio"/> 1	<input type="radio"/> 1	Incorporated or Principal Place of Business in This State	<input type="radio"/> 4	<input type="radio"/> 4																				
Citizen of Another State	<input type="radio"/> 2	<input type="radio"/> 2	Incorporated and Principal Place of Business in Another State	<input type="radio"/> 5	<input type="radio"/> 5																				
Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country	<input type="radio"/> 3	<input type="radio"/> 3	Foreign Nation	<input type="radio"/> 6	<input type="radio"/> 6																				

IV. CASE ASSIGNMENT AND NATURE OF SUIT

(Place an X in one category, A-N, that best represents your Cause of Action and one in a corresponding Nature of Suit)

<input type="radio"/> A. Antitrust <input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust	<input type="radio"/> B. Personal Injury/Malpractice <input type="checkbox"/> 310 Airplane <input type="checkbox"/> 315 Airplane Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 320 Assault, Libel & Slander <input type="checkbox"/> 330 Federal Employers Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 340 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 345 Marine Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 350 Motor Vehicle <input type="checkbox"/> 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 360 Other Personal Injury <input type="checkbox"/> 362 Medical Malpractice <input type="checkbox"/> 365 Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 367 Health Care/Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 368 Asbestos Product Liability	<input type="radio"/> C. Administrative Agency Review <input type="checkbox"/> 151 Medicare Act <u>Social Security</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 861 HIA (1395ff) <input type="checkbox"/> 862 Black Lung (923) <input type="checkbox"/> 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) <input type="checkbox"/> 864 SSID Title XVI <input type="checkbox"/> 865 RSI (405(g)) <u>Other Statutes</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 891 Agricultural Acts <input type="checkbox"/> 893 Environmental Matters <input type="checkbox"/> 890 Other Statutory Actions (If Administrative Agency is Involved)	<input type="radio"/> D. Temporary Restraining Order/Preliminary Injunction Any nature of suit from any category may be selected for this category of case assignment. *(If Antitrust, then A governs)*
<input type="radio"/> E. General Civil (Other) OR <input type="radio"/> F. Pro Se General Civil			
<u>Real Property</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 210 Land Condemnation <input type="checkbox"/> 220 Foreclosure <input type="checkbox"/> 230 Rent, Lease & Ejectment <input type="checkbox"/> 240 Torts to Land <input type="checkbox"/> 245 Tort Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 290 All Other Real Property <u>Personal Property</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 370 Other Fraud <input type="checkbox"/> 371 Truth in Lending <input type="checkbox"/> 380 Other Personal Property Damage <input type="checkbox"/> 385 Property Damage Product Liability	<u>Bankruptcy</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 422 Appeal 27 USC 158 <input type="checkbox"/> 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 <u>Prisoner Petitions</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 535 Death Penalty <input type="checkbox"/> 540 Mandamus & Other <input type="checkbox"/> 550 Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 555 Prison Conditions <input type="checkbox"/> 560 Civil Detainee – Conditions of Confinement <u>Property Rights</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 820 Copyrights <input type="checkbox"/> 830 Patent <input type="checkbox"/> 840 Trademark <u>Federal Tax Suits</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 870 Taxes (US plaintiff or defendant) <input type="checkbox"/> 871 IRS-Third Party 26 USC 7609	<u>Forfeiture/Penalty</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 <input type="checkbox"/> 690 Other <u>Other Statutes</u> <input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act <input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a)) <input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment <input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks & Banking <input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce/ICC Rates/etc. <input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation <input type="checkbox"/> 462 Naturalization Application <input type="checkbox"/> 465 Other Immigration Actions	<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced & Corrupt Organization <input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit <input type="checkbox"/> 490 Cable/Satellite TV <input type="checkbox"/> 850 Securities/Commodities/Exchange <input type="checkbox"/> 896 Arbitration <input type="checkbox"/> 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision <input type="checkbox"/> 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes <input type="checkbox"/> 890 Other Statutory Actions (if not administrative agency review or Privacy Act)

<input type="radio"/> G. Habeas Corpus/ 2255 <input type="checkbox"/> 530 Habeas Corpus – General <input type="checkbox"/> 510 Motion/Vacate Sentence <input type="checkbox"/> 463 Habeas Corpus – Alien Detainee	<input type="radio"/> H. Employment Discrimination <input type="checkbox"/> 442 Civil Rights – Employment (criteria: race, gender/sex, national origin, discrimination, disability, age, religion, retaliation) <i>*(If pro se, select this deck)*</i>	<input checked="" type="radio"/> I. FOIA/Privacy Act <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 895 Freedom of Information Act <input type="checkbox"/> 890 Other Statutory Actions (if Privacy Act) <i>*(If pro se, select this deck)*</i>	<input type="radio"/> J. Student Loan <input type="checkbox"/> 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loan (excluding veterans)
<input type="radio"/> K. Labor/ERISA (non-employment) <input type="checkbox"/> 710 Fair Labor Standards Act <input type="checkbox"/> 720 Labor/Mgmt. Relations <input type="checkbox"/> 740 Labor Railway Act <input type="checkbox"/> 751 Family and Medical Leave Act <input type="checkbox"/> 790 Other Labor Litigation <input type="checkbox"/> 791 Empl. Ret. Inc. Security Act	<input type="radio"/> L. Other Civil Rights (non-employment) <input type="checkbox"/> 441 Voting (if not Voting Rights Act) <input type="checkbox"/> 443 Housing/Accommodations <input type="checkbox"/> 440 Other Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 445 Americans w/Disabilities – Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 446 Americans w/Disabilities – Other <input type="checkbox"/> 448 Education	<input type="radio"/> M. Contract <input type="checkbox"/> 110 Insurance <input type="checkbox"/> 120 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 130 Miller Act <input type="checkbox"/> 140 Negotiable Instrument <input type="checkbox"/> 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment <input type="checkbox"/> 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits <input type="checkbox"/> 160 Stockholder's Suits <input type="checkbox"/> 190 Other Contracts <input type="checkbox"/> 195 Contract Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 196 Franchise	<input type="radio"/> N. Three-Judge Court <input type="checkbox"/> 441 Civil Rights – Voting (if Voting Rights Act)

V. ORIGIN
☒ 1 Original Proceeding
 ☐ 2 Removed from State Court
 ☐ 3 Remanded from Appellate Court
 ☐ 4 Reinstated or Reopened
 ☐ 5 Transferred from another district (specify)
 ☐ 6 Multi-district Litigation
 ☐ 7 Appeal to District Judge from Mag. Judge

VI. CAUSE OF ACTION (CITE THE U.S. CIVIL STATUTE UNDER WHICH YOU ARE FILING AND WRITE A BRIEF STATEMENT OF CAUSE.)
 5 U.S.C. 552. Defendant has failed to provide responsive records to FOIA requests.

VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT	CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER F.R.C.P. 23 <input type="checkbox"/>	DEMAND \$	JURY DEMAND: YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
------------------------------------	--	------------------	---

VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY (See instruction) YES ☐ NO ☒ If yes, please complete related case form

DATE: 3/6/2019

SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD:

INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLETING CIVIL COVER SHEET JS-44
 Authority for Civil Cover Sheet

The JS-44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replaces nor supplements the filings and services of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. Consequently, a civil cover sheet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil complaint filed. Listed below are tips for completing the civil cover sheet. These tips coincide with the Roman Numerals on the cover sheet.

- I.** COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF/DEFENDANT (b) County of residence: Use 11001 to indicate plaintiff if resident of Washington, DC, 88888 if plaintiff is resident of United States but not Washington, DC, and 99999 if plaintiff is outside the United States.
- III.** CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES: This section is completed only if diversity of citizenship was selected as the Basis of Jurisdiction under Section II.
- IV.** CASE ASSIGNMENT AND NATURE OF SUIT: The assignment of a judge to your case will depend on the category you select that best represents the primary cause of action found in your complaint. You may select only one category. You must also select one corresponding nature of suit found under the category of the case.
- VI.** CAUSE OF ACTION: Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing and write a brief statement of the primary cause.
- VIII.** RELATED CASE(S), IF ANY: If you indicated that there is a related case, you must complete a related case form, which may be obtained from the Clerk's Office.

Because of the need for accurate and complete information, you should ensure the accuracy of the information provided prior to signing the form.

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA**

_____)	
<i>Plaintiff</i>)	
)	
v.)	Civil Action No.
)	
_____)	
<i>Defendant</i>)	

SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: *(Defendant's name and address)*

A lawsuit has been filed against you.

Within 30 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are:

If you fail to respond, judgment by default may be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT

Date: _____

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Civil Action No. _____

PROOF OF SERVICE*(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))*

This summons for *(name of individual and title, if any)* _____
 was received by me on *(date)* _____.

☐ I personally served the summons on the individual at *(place)* _____
 _____ on *(date)* _____; or

☐ I left the summons at the individual's residence or usual place of abode with *(name)* _____
 _____, a person of suitable age and discretion who resides there,
 on *(date)* _____, and mailed a copy to the individual's last known address; or

☐ I served the summons on *(name of individual)* _____, who is
 designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of *(name of organization)* _____
 _____ on *(date)* _____; or

☐ I returned the summons unexecuted because _____; or

☐ Other *(specify)*: _____.

My fees are \$ _____ for travel and \$ _____ for services, for a total of \$ _____.

I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.

Date: _____

Server's signature

Printed name and title

Server's address

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA**

_____)	
<i>Plaintiff</i>)	
)	
v.)	Civil Action No.
)	
_____)	
<i>Defendant</i>)	

SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: *(Defendant's name and address)*

A lawsuit has been filed against you.

Within 30 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are:

If you fail to respond, judgment by default may be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT

Date: _____

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Civil Action No. _____

PROOF OF SERVICE*(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))*

This summons for *(name of individual and title, if any)* _____
 was received by me on *(date)* _____.

☐ I personally served the summons on the individual at *(place)* _____
 _____ on *(date)* _____; or

☐ I left the summons at the individual's residence or usual place of abode with *(name)* _____
 _____, a person of suitable age and discretion who resides there,
 on *(date)* _____, and mailed a copy to the individual's last known address; or

☐ I served the summons on *(name of individual)* _____, who is
 designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of *(name of organization)* _____
 _____ on *(date)* _____; or

☐ I returned the summons unexecuted because _____; or

☐ Other *(specify)*: _____.

My fees are \$ _____ for travel and \$ _____ for services, for a total of \$ _____.

I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.

Date: _____

Server's signature

Printed name and title

Server's address

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

BAR IDENTIFICATION NO.

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA**

_____)	
<i>Plaintiff</i>)	
)	
v.)	Civil Action No.
)	
_____)	
<i>Defendant</i>)	

SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: *(Defendant's name and address)*

A lawsuit has been filed against you.

Within 30 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are:

If you fail to respond, judgment by default may be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT

Date: _____

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Civil Action No. _____

PROOF OF SERVICE*(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))*

This summons for *(name of individual and title, if any)* _____
 was received by me on *(date)* _____.

☐ I personally served the summons on the individual at *(place)* _____
 _____ on *(date)* _____; or

☐ I left the summons at the individual's residence or usual place of abode with *(name)* _____
 _____, a person of suitable age and discretion who resides there,
 on *(date)* _____, and mailed a copy to the individual's last known address; or

☐ I served the summons on *(name of individual)* _____, who is
 designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of *(name of organization)* _____
 _____ on *(date)* _____; or

☐ I returned the summons unexecuted because _____; or

☐ Other *(specify)*: _____.

My fees are \$ _____ for travel and \$ _____ for services, for a total of \$ _____.

I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.

Date: _____

Server's signature

Printed name and title

Server's address

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc: